

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE
Tanay, Rizal

Page | 1Water

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
19	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Magkaroon ng maayos na supply ng potable water dito sa Barangay at sa buong Tanay.	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama po ito sa plano.	Include in the plan the following: assurance sufficient water supply, irrigation, sanitation and dainage, safety of the sacred cemetery, 2000 affected families in Daraitan, and early warning system for Barangay Daraitan and in entire Tanay	These will all form part of the plans and programs for Daraitan and Tanay. We will review again the list of the affected families and consider the suggestions.
21	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Pag-aralan ang kasaysayan ng pagbaha sa Daraitan	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama po ito sa plano.		
22	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Isama sa plano ang pagsasaayos ng sanitasyon at drainage	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama po ito sa plano.		

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE
Tanay, Rizal

People

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
6	Conrado R. Vargas, Infanta Quezon:	Paano masisiguro ang hindi maglubog ng Tinipak?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Ang full supply level ay 160m pero ang ang riverbed ay 99m o 100m, tapos ang taas ng pader ng dam ay 60m. 160m ang taas ng maximum water supply level.	How can MWSS really ensure that Tinipak will not be submered?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: The full supply level is 160m, and the river bed is about 100m, thus the maximum water supply level is only 160m.
8	Jaime D. Vista, Tanay LGU	Gaano katiyak na hindi tatamaan ang sagradong Tinipak River?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: May hinihinging proposal na sa Chinese Contractor para hindi pumasok ang tubig sa Tinipak; advance spilling feature ay pwedeng magrelease ng mga 50 centimeters per hour.	What is our assurance that Tinipak River will not be submerged?	The Chinese Contractor will soon provide a proposal that protects Tinipak River from the rise of water leve; Advance Spilling feature of the dam provides the capacity to release 50 centimeters per hour in case there was a heavy rainfall warning.
23	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Iaayos at gawing ligtas ang sagradong sementeryo ng Daraitan.	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama po ito sa plano.		
24	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Isama ang mahigit 2000 na kabahayan sa Daraitan sa listahan ng apektadong pamilya.	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Babalikan ulit ang listahan para maisama ang mga taga-Daraitan		
25	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Anong plano para sa early warning system sa Daraitan?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama sa plano ang pagpapalakas ng Barangay DRRMO, sa		

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE

Tanay, Rizal

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
			pamamagitan ng training, equipment at early warning system.		
29	Maria Clara Dullas, IPS	Dapat tingnan ng MWSS ang ADSDPP muna bago bumuo ng panibagong plano; Isama ang tunay na kasiguruhan ng kaunlarang pangkabuhayan sa mga katutubo, para hindi maulit ang karanasan ng IPs sa Angat Dam.		MWSS must revisit first the ADSDPP before developing a new plan for the IPs. The development of IPs must be truly integrated in the plan to avoid the sad experience of IPs in Angat Dam.	
32	T. Aumentado, Gen. Nakar	Sakop ng Gen. Nakar ang ilog Daraitan, pero may kasunduan ang mga katutuo para sa magkatuwang na pamamahala dito.	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco: May pag-uusap na ang Bayan ng Nakar at Tanay tungkol diyan. Ang malagang pag-usapan dito ay ang kasiguruhan hindi malulubok ang Ilog Tinipak dahil ito ay sa Lalawigan ng Rizal.	Gen. Nakar has full jurisdiction over the Daraitan River; the IPs have agreed to jointly oversee the management of the said river.	Gen. Nakar and Tanay LGU have arrangements on the matter, let this not be discussed here because our main concern here is to ensure the safety of Tinipak - that is under the jurisdiction of Rizal Province.
33	Demosthenes Reynera, Executive Director ng Tribal Center for Development,	Irerelocate ba ang mga taga-Daraitan dahil sa nakikitang panganib na dulot nila sa kalinisan ng tubig sa ilog?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Hindi na kailangang i-relocate ang mga taga-Daraitan dahil kasama sa plano ang sanitasyon at drainage, ganun din ang pagtatayo ng waste treatment plant.	Will the Daraitan resident be relocated after finding out the probable negative impact of the households to the water quality?	Relocation of the Daraitan Residents is not an option right now because the project team looks at institutionalization of sanitation, drainage and septage treatment facilities / systems instead.

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE

Tanay, Rizal

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
	Kinatawan ng Diocese of Infanta, Quezon				
34	Jenifer Gerones, Field Officer, NCIP	Ayusin maigi ang presentasyon ng proyekto para maunawaan ng mga Katutubo kapag ng FPIC; may paglabag sa batas kung pagiisahin ang IPDP at Community Development Plan dahil may espesyal na pagtangi sa mga IPs; isama ang mga tao sa Daraitan sa mga apektado ng Kaliwa Dam; Kailangang i-check sa sagradong sementeryo. Kailangang hindi ito lulubog.	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Aayusin ang presentasyon para sa FPIC; titingnan muli ang IPDP nang naayon sa umiiral na batas ng IPs	Revise the presentation that explains well to the IPs once the FPIC begins; fusion of IPDP under the Community Development plan violates the existing laws on IP Rigts; Include the Daraitan households in the list of affected families as presented; Ensure to keep the cemetery safe and will not be submerged.	We will revise the presentation for the FPIC process; we will revisit the IPDP based on the existing IP laws.
35	Conrado Vargas, Infanta	May FPIC ba sa 10-year watershed management project.	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Wala po, dahil ang aming kakontrata ay ang LGU ng Gen. Nakar.	Has the proponent secured the necessary FPIC on the 10-year watershed management project?	None at the moment because the MOA of MWSS is with Gen. Nakar LGU.
43	Marcelino Tena, Sagibin LN, Gen. Nakar	Pag-aralan muli ang plano at siguruhing igalang ang aming batas at kultura, pati ang batas ng kalikasan.		Revisit the plan again and make sure that our laws, culture and laws of nature are all taken into account.	

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE
Tanay, Rizal

Air

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
	No Issues/Concerns raised during the hearing				

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE
Tanay, Rizal

Land

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
	No Issues/Concerns raised during the hearing				

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE
Tanay, Rizal

Project Description

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
1	Octavio Pranada, Indigenous People Structure (IPS)	Dumaan po ba sa public scoping?	Atty. J.E. Ang: Ipapaliwanag mamaya ng MWSS.	Did the proponent hold a public scoping before this public hearing?	It will be explained later.
2	Maria Clara Dullas, Indigenous People Structure (IPS)	Dahil hindi nag-public scoping dito sa Daraitan. Ito ay dinedeklara ng IPS at IPMR na hindi isang public hearing.	Atty. J.E. Ang: Ipapaliwanag mamaya ng MWSS.	Because there was a failure to provide proof that a public scoping was held in Daraitan, IPS and IPMR declared that the public hearing was null and void.	It will be explained later.
5	Nila Grace O. Pranada, IPMR, Daraitan, Tanay, Rizal	Iba ang sukat ng MWSS/EDCOP sa elevation ng Daraitan kumpara sa sukat na nakuha ni N.G.O. Pranada. Kung kaya may pangamba na lulubog ang ilog ng Tinipak.	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Talagang mababa ang sukat ng Tinipak, per gagawan ng paraan para maging ligtas ang Tinipak River.	There was a discrepancy between the measurements of MWSS/EDCOP and N.G.O. Pranada on elevation in Daraitan; Lower elevation of Tinipak posits a dreadful possibility that the river will be submerged.	The Tinipak River has a low elevation, and this will be the foremost consideration in the dam design - that is to ensure safety of Tinipak River.
7	Grace Planada, IBMR, Katutubong Tribo Dumagat-Remontado	Hiningi ang pruwera na nagpublic scoping ang MWSS sa Daraitan. Ngunit hindi tinanggap at ipinakita	Atty. J.E. Ang: Sagutin muna nating ang mga	Urged MWSS to provide a proof that a public scoping was held in Daraitan; but when the	Let's focus first on the questions that concern the presentation.

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE

Tanay, Rizal

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
		na nakasulat sa isang notebook.	katanungan mula sa presentasyon.	proponent showed a note on a notebook, it was not accepted as valid.	
9	Jaime D. Vista, Tanay LGU	Paano kung ang resulta ng assessment sa proyektong ito ay maging negative, itutuloy pa ba ang Kaliwa Dam Project?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Kung sabihin ng DENR na hindi sila mag-issue ng ECC, wala kaming magagawa doon.	What if the result of the assessment was negative, will Kaliwa Dam project still proceed?	Whatever is the decision of DENR, we cannot proceed without an ECC.
10	Jaime D. Vista, Tanay LGU	Kahit ba may mga negative impacts ang proyekto, pwede pa rin ba itong ituloy?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Lahat ng proyekto ay may maganda at hindi magandang maidudulot. Kaya may mitigation measures para maibsan o maiwasan ang mga negative impacts ng proyekto.	Will the project push through even if it has negative impacts?	All projects have plus or minus. That is why the project team thinks of ways to reduce or totally eliminate the the negative impacts of the project.
11	Pasencio San Jose, Tribu sa Panggitna.	Daanin sa legal na proseso ang lahat; pag-aralan ang kasaysayan ng pagbaha sa Daraitan; siguruhing hindi bumaha sa Daraitan.	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Ang full supply level dapat hindi lumampas ng 160 m. Iyong lugar ng Kaliwa Dam, iyon ay humigit kumulang na 100m, para maging 160m, mga animnapu ang taas ng	Always make sure to follow the legal process. It is important to study also the history of flooding in Daraitan so future flooding impacts can be reduced.	The full supply level of Kaliwa Dam is 160m. The Kaliwa Dam has a depth of 100m, to make it 160m, the wall's height is 60m. We assure you, Daraitan

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE
Tanay, Rizal

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
			pader. Hindi po aabutin ang Daraitan.		will not be flooded due to the dam.
12	Raffy Reyes, Business Group	Na-award na po ba ang proyekto?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Ang loan agreement a ma-award lamang po kung makakuha ng ECC.	Has the project been awarded?	The loan agreement will only be awarded upon the issuance of ECC.
13	Raffy Reyes, Business Group	Ano ang kasiguraduhan na may sapat na karanasan ang China Energy para gawing matibay ang dam?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Napag-aralan maigi ng NEDA Board ang proyekto at dumaaan sa tamang proseso ang pagtukoy sa contractor. Kasama ang karanasan sa paggawa ng dam sa requirements ng bidding document.	What is the assurance that China Energy has the capacity and experience in developing a resilient dam?	That is part o the ECC requirements and the bidding documents - experience of the contractor.
14	Raffy Reyes, Business Group	Bakit gumagawa ng kalsada ang MWSS pabor sa paggawa ng dam?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Ang mga kalsada ay proyekto ng DPWH at hindi ng MWSS.	Why was MWSS involved in the road construction?	Road construction is under DPWH and not MWSS.
15	Engr. Carlos E. Inofre Jr., Municipal Officer, Tanay, Rizal	Possible bang mabawasan ang height ng dam pero pareho rin ang dami ng tubig?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Kung mababa ang dam, madaling mapuno ng batong maliliit ang dam. 60 metrong taas ng dam ay ang pinakaligtas na taas ng dam at	Can the dam height still be reduced?	If the dam has a lower wall, it can be easily filled with the sediments. To have a more sustianable water supply, the most

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE
Tanay, Rizal

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
			pangmatagalan na makakapag-imbak ng tubig.		appropriate and viable dam height is 60 m.
17	Engr. Carlos E. Inofre Jr., Municipal Officer, Tanay, Rizal	Iyong gagawing tunnel, may identified fault line, bandang Barangay Guyambay, hindi ba delikado ito?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Sang-ayon sa aming structural geologist, maigsi lang ang fault line. Ang ibig sabihin ay hindi kumpirmadong major fault. Inaalam din kung gaano kalalim ang fault. Kasama ito sa kumpletong disenyo ng dam.	Regarding the underground tunnel, there are existing fault line near Barangay Guyambay, is this safe?	According to our structural geologist, the fault lines are short and dash lines on the map, meaning these are confirmed non-major fault lines. We are confirming the depth of these fault lines. Rest assured, these will form part of the final design.
18	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Anong kasiguruhan na susunod ang China sa standards?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Hindi aprubahan ang disenyo at plano kung hindi sumunod sa standards	What is our assurance that China will follow the standards?	MWSS will not approve the design of the dam if it would not be according to the existing standards.
26	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Sino po ang mag-operate ng dam?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: MWSS ang mangangasiwa	Who shall operate the dam?	MWSS shall operate and manage the dam.
27	Maria Clara Dullas, IPS	Idineklara na hindi public hearing ang idinaos na pagpupulong dahil sa paglabag sa NCIP guidelines at sa	(noted)	Declared that the public hearing was null and void due to failure to adhere in the NCIP guidelines and	(noted)

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE

Tanay, Rizal

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
		pagkakaroon muna ng public scoping.		the failure to conduct public scoping.	
28	Maria Clara Dullas, IPS	Ang Laiban Dam ba ang karugtong ng Kaliwa Dam?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Hindi po. Ang Laiban Dam ay matagal nang pinatigil ng gobyerno. Hindi ito inaprubahan. Ang Kaliwa Dam lang ang inaprubahan ng NEDA Board.	Is Laiban Dam the next dam to be constructed after Kaliwa Dam?	No. The government has abandoned the construction of Laiban Dam. It was not approved. The NEDA Board only approved Kaliwa Dam Project.
30	Orlando R. Peñamante, Presidente ng Sukatan L.N. at ng Asian Farmers' Association (AFA) na binubuo ng 24 countries:	Hindi pagpapaalam sa pagkuha ng larawan sa ilog; Bakit ang sinasabi ay Kaliwa Dam pero ang ipinakita sa larawan ay sa Manggahan?		The proponents failed to request for permission to take photos at the river (as shown in the powerpoint presentation); The proponents showed misleading photos which illustrated Manggahan, instead of the Kaliwa River.	
31	Eufemia T. Enciso, Pangulo ng IPO, Bayan ng Tanay	Kailangang sundin ng MWSS muna ang NCIP Guidelines, tungkol sa FPIC, at doon pag-usapan at magkasundo sa mga		MWSS must adhere first to the NCIP guidelines and proceed with the FPIC to flesh out all	

MATRIX OF ISSUES RAISED AND THE PROPONENT'S/DENR RESPONSE

Tanay, Rizal

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
		isyu ukol sa Kaliwa Dam Project		issues and concerns on Kaliwa Da Project.	
41	Armeya, Barangay Sto. Niño, Member ng IP Political Structure	Alisin ang "New Centennial Water Source" sa pamagat ng proyekto at gawing direktang "Kaliwa Dam Project" lamang.	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco: Gawing rekomendasyon sa pulong na ito ang pagtanggap ng "New Centennial Water Source" sa pamagat ng proyekto upang maiwasan ang agam-agam at pagkalito ng mga tao.	Remove "New Centennial Water Source" from the title and indicate only "Kaliwa Dam Project"	Let it be the recommendation from today's public hearing to adopt and reflect only "Kaliwa Dam Project" to avoid confusion among the community members.
42	Clarita D.C. Armea, IPs, Barangay Sto. Niño	Anong kasiguruha namin na ang Laiban Dam ay hindi n tutuloy.	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Ang Kaliwa Dam na may 28km na tunnel, at hindi Laiban Dam ang inaprubahan ng NEDA Board.	What assurance can we have that Laiban will never ver push through?	NEDA Board only approved Kaliwa Dam with a 28-meter tunnel and not Laiban Dam.