



**The New Centennial Water Source –  
Kaliwa Dam Project**

**PUBLIC HEARING  
IN TANAY, RIZAL**

**COVERED COURT**

**02 SEPTEMBER 2019**

**9:30 a.m. – 2:30 p.m.**

06 September 2019



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	LOCATION AND TIME .....	2
2	PREPARATION .....	2
3	PURPOSE OF THE PUBLIC HEARING .....	2
4	HIGHLIGHTS OF THE PUBLIC FORUM.....	2
4.1	WELCOME REMARKS .....	3
4.2	RECOGNITION OF PARTICIPANTS.....	3
4.3	PROGRAM FLOW.....	4
4.4	INQUIRY ON THE VALIDITY OF THE PUBLIC HEARING.....	4
4.5	MESSAGE FROM VICE MAYOR R.A. TANJUATCO, TANAY, RIZAL .....	4
4.6	OBJECTIVES AND RATIONALE OF PUBLIC HEARING .....	5
4.7	PUBLIC HEARING HOUSE RULES .....	6
4.8	KALIWA DAM PROJECT DETAILS.....	6
4.9	SALIENT POINTS ON THE EIA STUDY .....	7
4.10	SUMMARY OF ISSUES / CONCERNS RAISED AT THE OPEN FORUM.....	9
5	FORUM OUTPUTS .....	22
6	ADJOURNMENT.....	23
7	ANNEXES.....	24

## LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 1.	SUMMARY OF ISSUES / CONCERNS / INTERESTS RAISED AT THE PUBLIC HEARING .....	10
----------	---	----

## **1 LOCATION AND TIME**

This is the fourth Public Hearing for the project, entitled, “The New Centennial Water Source – Kaliwa Dam Project”. This was held at the Covered Courts of Barangay Daraitan, Tanay, Rizal on 02 September 2019, from 9:30 a.m. to 2:30 p.m.

## **2 PREPARATION**

The main objective of the Public Hearing was to provide an in-depth discussion on the project details and the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) study on Kaliwa Dam Project. The participants were enjoined to provide feedback and opinions as regards the provided presentations, as well as their issues and concerns. In order to properly document the public hearing, the proponent prepared video and audio recorders, as well as documentors to capture the salient points of the discussions and verbatim account on the open forum proper.

*ANNEX 1: ATTENDANCE SHEET*

## **3 PURPOSE OF THE PUBLIC HEARING**

The main objective of the Public Hearing was to provide an in-depth discussion on the project details and the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) study on Kaliwa Dam Project. The participants were enjoined to provide feedback and opinions as regards the provided presentations, as well as their issues and concerns. In order to properly document the public hearing, the proponent prepared video and audio recorders, as well as documentors to capture the salient points of the discussions.

## **4 HIGHLIGHTS OF THE PUBLIC FORUM**

The Public Hearing was called to order at 9:30 a.m., with Engr. Lene Ramboyong presiding. The invocation was led by Pastor Christopher A. Amoin and Imelda A. Oliveros, followed by the singing of the National Anthem.

There were 400 attendees, with 197 male and 203 female participants.

*ANNEX 2. AFFIDAVIT OF PUBLICATION IN PHILIPPINE STAR*

#### **4.1 WELCOME REMARKS**

##### **RODEL S. HINAGPISAN, PUNONG BARANGAY, DARAITAN, TANAY**

Greeted and welcomed everyone for coming and for participating in the public hearing. He also recognized the representatives from the community of Daraitan, from DENR, MWSS and other nearby areas.

#### **4.2 RECOGNITION OF PARTICIPANTS**

Engr. L. Ramboyong acknowledged the presence of the following:

- Engr. Vic Arrida, EMB
- Atty. James Edward Ang, EMB / Public Hearing Officer
- Jess Toniala – FMB
- Jess Javier, FMB
- Ernie Villalva
- Daniel Garino, BMB

He also noted the following submitted their position papers regarding this project:

1. Mga kapatid na katutubong Dumagat-Remontado
2. Philippine Movement for Climate Justice
3. Sanlakas
4. Center for Energy and Ecology
5. Freedom from Debt Coalition
6. School of Environmental Science and Management
7. Pambansang Kilusan ng Samahang Magsasaka
8. Non-Timber Forest Products Exchange Program, Philippines
9. Prelature of Infanta Community Organization of the Philippines, Inc.
10. Haribon Foundation
11. Sukatan LN
12. Purple Action for Indigenous Women's Rights
13. Save the Sierra Madre Movement

This was followed by the recognition of representatives from the following Barangays:

1. Alas
2. Asin
3. Banbanan

4. Daraitan
5. Laiban
6. Mabuyao

#### **4.3 PROGRAM FLOW**

Engr. L. Ramboyong presented the program flow with the following details:

1. Engr. Arida to discuss the rationale and objectives of public hearing
2. Atty. J.E. Ang to discuss the rules of public hearing
3. Engr. L.C. Cleofas to present the Project Details
4. Engr. N.M. Ortigas to present the results of the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Study
5. Atty. J.E. Ang to facilitate the Open Forum

#### **4.4 INQUIRY ON THE VALIDITY OF THE PUBLIC HEARING**

Octavio Pranada, Indigenous People Structure (IPS) and Maria Clara Dullas (IPS) raised the concern on the alleged failure to conduct a public scoping meeting and failure to secure an FPIC from the IPs of Daraitan prior to the Public Hearing. After some minutes of discussion off the microphone, M.C. Dullas announced that they agreed to proceed with the activity, but declared that the public hearing was null and void due to the non-compliance with the NCIP and DENR guidelines. She added that the activity shall only be considered as an informal meeting and not as a public hearing.

#### **4.5 MESSAGE FROM VICE MAYOR R.A. TANJUATCO, TANAY, RIZAL**

Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco highlighted in his message the need to keep the Barangay Daraitan and the Tinipak River safe and secured from being submerged due to the influx of water from the dam, should it push through. He also assured the barangay constituents that the Tanay LGU shall ensure that their concerns would be properly addressed. It was also pointed out that a long term and sustainable livelihood program must be in place to ensure continuous development of the Barangay, including its constituents, both IPs and non-IPs. The sentiments of the people need to be heard and be considered in the entire Kaliwa Dam Project.

#### 4.6 OBJECTIVES AND RATIONALE OF PUBLIC HEARING

**Engr. V. Arrida** briefly discussed the background on public hearing, its objectives, rationale and process. He cited that the procedure being followed in a public hearing was based on the Presidential Decree (PD) 1586 or the Philippine Environmental Impact System (PEIS). Likewise, it was noted that the qualified projects under this law need to apply for an Environmental Compliance Certificate (ECC); and these projects include golf courses and dams, such as Kaliwa Dam.

He highlighted that the projects can be categorized into two: Environmental Critical Projects (ECP) (e.g. projects with critical impacts on the environment) and Non-ECP (e.g. gasoline station, piggery, etc.).

The ECC application process involves the following:

- Screening
- Public Scoping, where opinions of the stakeholders were gathered and submitted to DENR.
- Technical Scoping assists the EMB in the appraisal of the project. The team develops the requirements for the Environmental Impact Assessment.
- Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) has two types: Environmental Impact Study for new projects and Environmental Performance Report and Management Plan (EPRMP) for existing projects.
- Technical Evaluation where LGU representatives would be invited.
- Part of the review was the Public Hearings to fully assess the project. In the public hearing, the results of the EIS would be presented, including the issues that were previously raised. The process needs to be properly documented and compiled to elicit the issues that need to be addressed by the MWSS.
- One of the requirements of ECC is the putting-up of the Multipartite Monitoring Team (MMT). This team works closely with DENR to ensure proper management of the project.

He enjoined everyone to participate in the open forum and surface all issues and concerns that can assist DENR in properly reviewing the proposed project.

**Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco** inquired about the details on the said environmental fund to finance the activities of MMT in case the dam pushes through. He requested for clarification on the assurance that the community will ever benefit from the said environmental fund.

**Engr. V. Arrida** replied that the Environmental Guarantee Fund (EGF) is part of the ECC requirements as per DAO 2015-02. This is deposited in the bank and can be accessed in case there would be any environmental problem in the future. He added that the MMT shall establish its environmental monitoring fund (EMF) to finance MMT-related activities which guidelines are stipulated in DAO 2017-15.

**Maria Clara Dullas** wanted a clearer and more direct answer to the query of Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco regarding the access to the said guarantee fund. **Engr. V. Arrida** replied that a Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) shall be executed later in coordination with DENR. **M.C. Dullas** underscored that the IP leaders must be part of the said MOA and everything has to be done legally.

#### **4.7 PUBLIC HEARING HOUSE RULES**

Atty. J.E. Ang presented the public hearing house rules. He advised the participants to take note of the project presentation details and the issues and concerns that may be raised at the Open Forum proper. He reminded the participants that the queries need to be related with the presentations only. His final note for those who would raise their questions was to stay calm during the open forum and clearly cite the issues and concerns that need to be addressed by the proponents.

#### **4.8 KALIWA DAM PROJECT DETAILS**

Engr. C.L. Cleofas discussed the following, based on the prepared slides for this public hearing:

- Presented the project details of Kaliwa Dam, which is composed of 27.7 km underground tunnel from Sitio Queborosa of Infanta and up to Teresa, Rizal. The water treatment plant will be developed in Teresa, Rizal.
- Explained that the Kaliwa Dam's wall has a height of 60 meters.
- Showed a photo of Ipo Dam that will also be the design of Kaliwa Dam.
- Emphasized that the Kaliwa Dam shall strictly implement the standards for safety and precautionary measures.

- Mentioned about the technology of tunnel boring machine that will be used in laying the underground tunnel.
- Underscored that the first beneficiaries of water will be the constituents of Rizal.
- Presented the communities which will be directly and indirectly affected by the project with about 55 households based on the their most current survey.
- Explained the benefits from Kaliwa Dam project and these are: employment generation; economic development; establishment of an information center, and turnover of facilities upon completion of the dam to the LGU; tourism; road and other infrastructure development (e.g. irrigation system, flood control, bridges, among others). The trainings will be coordinated with TESDA.
- Emphasized the current arrangement or Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) of MWSS with Gen. Nakar regarding the watershed management, rehabilitation and protection. This includes training for the IPs who shall form part of the Bantay Gubat group. The same strategy is being implemented in Ipo Dam as well.
- Noted that a Presidential Task Force was formed to oversee the entire project. This team is composed of various government agencies, and MWSS is just one of the member organizations.
- Assured the body that MWSS shall facilitate the arrangements with DPWH for the necessary construction of roads and infrastructure.
- The Access Road (KM 92) is done by the DPWH, in collaboration with MWSS.
- Envisions the flourishing of tourism in Daraitan once everything has been set-up.

#### **4.9 SALIENT POINTS ON THE EIA STUDY**

Engr. N.M. Ortigas briefly discussed the EIA study outputs to the body, baed on the updating activities that his team has conducted. Highlights of his presentation are as follows:

- Watershed Development Program
- Protection of the existing flora and fauna
- Forest Cover: somewhat disconnected, with forest gaps, due to slash and burn practices in the area; suggested for an immediate rehabilitation of the forest.
- Need for a Memorandum of Agreement between and among the affected LGUs and MWSS to push for well-coordinated efforts.
- Development of a Climate Change Responsive and Integrated Master Plan which includes Gen. Nakar and Infanta.

- Safety of Kaliwa Dam shall be based on the Philippine Structural Code, to be able to withstand the strongest possible earthquake and the probable maximum flood. All other dams in the Philippines, the design is being study on a regular basis.
- Noted that even with the absence of a dam in Daraitan, its water can reach a height of 160m. Thus, the dam can help in controlling the volume of water.
- Reiterated that the sacred sites will be preserved, and alternatives are now on the drawing board. The sacred spring in Tinipak shall be carefully considered in the design, in such a way that the miraculous water of Tinipak shall be protected and preserved. The Chinese Contractor shall provide an enhanced design to consider this spring.
- Underscored the need to fix the sanitation and drainage system in Daraitan, particularly those near the river. He emphasized that MWSS shall establish a wastewater treatment plant in Daraitan to keep the water quality of the river.
- While the project is ongoing, it was mentioned the that environmental management plan and occupational health and safety program shall be established.
- With regards to risks from earthquake, the body was assured that the dam shall be disaster risk resilient to withstand the strongest earthquake possible to hit the area.
- Emphasized that the community of Daraitan has a higher elevation compared with the maximum water level in the dam; thus, shall not be submerged in water during the dam operation.
- Assured the community that everything shall be in consultation with the community and IP leaders, given that the Kaliwa Watershed is covered by two (2) Ancestral Domains.
- Presented the brief details on Indigenous People Development Plan and the Community Development Plan to ensure the sustainable coverage of the social development in the affected areas. These plans shall focus on the interventions that the MWSS shall implement, in coordination with the local communities.
- Assured the people that no construction shall be made until all affected communities have been relocated.

Details of the presentation can be found in:

*ANNEX 5 SALIENT POINTS ON KALIWA DAM PROJECT AND ITS EIA STUDY*

#### **4.10 SUMMARY OF ISSUES / CONCERNS RAISED AT THE OPEN FORUM**

At around 11:21 a.m., the the forum was opened for questions. Maria Clara Dullas was allowed to present the Daraitan Map, with the corresponding measurements of the elevation that was taken with the use of GPS. She pointed out the discrepancy of her measurement from that of EDCOP's presentation. Engr. N.M. Ortigas acknowledged the said measurements and pointed out that they have the same measurement for the Tinipak River which is 135m. He underscored that the design considers the safety of the Tinipak River.

The Open Forum was facilitated by Atty. J.E. Ang and provided a summary of the topics that were discussed at the end of the question and answer. The list of topics that were tackled at the Open Forum are as follows:

1. Elevation in Tinipak River, Barangay Daraitan and the Dam site.
2. Fault Lines that may pose hazards on the underground tunnel
3. Experiences in Ipo Dam, regarding the lives of IPs during the operations of the dam.
4. Alleged non-compliance with the NCIP Guidelines, public scoping requirements and failure to present sufficient legal documents
5. Awarding of contract to and expertise and integrity of China Energy
6. Benefits of Tanay and the residents of Barangay Daraitan
7. Coordination with the Water District ng Tanay
8. Comparison ng High Dam and Low Dam as proposed by JICA
9. Possibility to reduce the height of the dam
10. Early warning system and flood management scheme
11. DRR initiatives
12. Provision of sustainable potable water supply for Daraitan
13. History of flooding in Daraitan
14. Human security programs for Daraitan constituents
15. Septage treatment in the area
16. Safety of the sacred cemetery
17. Inclusion of the 2,000 households in Daraitan in the list of affected households by the Project
18. FPIC process and NCIP Guidelines
19. Revisiting of IPDP, based on the existing customary laws and IP laws
20. Revision on the project title to indicate only "Kaliwa Dam Project
21. Negative effects of the dam to people and environment
22. Liability and accountability of MWSS

## 23. Life span of Kaliwa Dam

The detailed presentation of the minutes of the Open Forum can be found in:

### *ANNEX 3.3: MINUTES OF THE OPEN FORUM*

The summary of issues and concerns raised are presented on Table 1.

*Table 1. Summary of Issues / Concerns / Interests Raised At The Public Hearing*

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
1	Octavio Pranada, Indigenous People Structure (IPS)	Dumaan po ba sa public scoping?	Atty. J.E. Ang: Ipapaliwanag mamaya ng MWSS.	Did the proponent hold a public scoping before this public hearing?	It will be explained later.
2	Maria Clara Dullas, Indigenous People Structure (IPS)	Dahil hindi nag-public scoping dito sa Daraitan. Ito ay dinedeklara ng IPS at IPMR na hindi isang public hearing.	Atty. J.E. Ang: Ipapaliwanag mamaya ng MWSS.	Because there was a failure to provide proof that a public scoping was held in Daraitan, IPS and IPMR declared that the public hearing was null and void.	It will be explained later.
3	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Paggamit ng Environmental Fund ng komunidad	Engr. C. Arrida: Sang-ayong sa DAO 2015-02, kasama ang Environmental Guarantee Fund (EGF) sa ECC requirements. Magkakaroon ng MOA in coordination with DENR. Kasama rin ang mga IP leaders dito.	Access in the Environmental Fund by the Community	Pursuant to DAO 2015-02, EGF is part of the ECC requirements. A MOA will be signed later, in coordination with DENR. IP Leaders shall also form part of the MOA.

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
4	OPEN FORUM (11:21 a.m.)				
5	Nila Grace O. Pranada, IPMR, Daraitan, Tanay, Rizal	Iba ang sukat ng MWSS/EDCOP sa elevation ng Daraitan kumpara sa sukat na nakuha ni N.G.O. Pranada. Kung kaya may pangamba na lulubog ang ilog ng Tinipak.	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Talagang mababa ang sukat ng Tinipak, per gagawan ng paraan para maging ligtas ang Tinipak River.	There was a discrepancy between the measurements of MWSS/EDCOP and N.G.O. Pranada on elevation in Daraitan; Lower elevation of Tinipak posits a dreadful possibility that the river will be submerged.	The Tinipak River has a low elevation, and this will be the foremost consideration in the dam design - that is to ensure safety of Tinipak River.
6	Conrado R. Vargas, Infanta Quezon:	Paano masisiguro ang hindi maglubog ng Tinipak?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Ang full supply level ay 160m pero ang ang riverbed ay 99m o 100m, tapos ang taas ng pader ng dam ay 60m. 160m ang taas ng maximum water supply level.	How can MWSS really ensure that Tinipak will not be submerged?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: The full supply level is 160m, and the riverbed is about 100m, thus the maximum water supply level is only 160m.
7	Grace Planada, IBMR, Katutubong Tribo Dumagat-Remontado	Hiningi ang pruwera na nagpublic scoping ang MWSS sa Daraitan. Ngunit hindi tinanggap at ipinakita na nakasulat sa isang notebook.	Atty. J.E. Ang: Sagutin muna nating ang mga katanungan mula sa presentasyon.	Urged MWSS to provide a proof that a public scoping was held in Daraitan; but when the proponent showed a note on a notebook, it was not accepted as valid.	Let's focus first on the questions that concern the presentation.

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
8	Jaime D. Vista, Tanay LGU	Gaano katiyak na hindi tatamaan ang sagradong Tinipak River?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: May hinihinging proposal na sa Chinese Contractor para hindi pumasok ang tubig sa Tinipak; advance spilling feature ay pwedeng magrelease ng mga 50 centimeters per hour.	What is our assurance that Tinipak River will not be submerged?	The Chinese Contractor will soon provide a proposal that protects Tinipak River from the rise of water leve; Advance Spilling feature of the dam provides the capacity to release 50 centimeters per hour in case there was a heavy rainfall warning.
9	Jaime D. Vista, Tanay LGU	Paano kung ang resulta ng assessment sa proyektong ito ay maging negative, itutuloy pa ba ang Kaliwa Dam Project?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Kung sabihin ng DENR na hindi sila mag-issue ng ECC, wala kaming magagawa doon.	What if the result of the assessment was negative, will Kaliwa Dam project still proceed?	Whatever is the decision of DENR, we cannot proceed without an ECC.
10	Jaime D. Vista, Tanay LGU	Kahit ba may mga negative impacts ang proyekto, pwede pa rin ba itong ituloy?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Lahat ng proyekto ay may maganda at hindi magandang maidudulot. Kaya may mitigation measures para maibsan o maiwasan ang mga negative impacts ng proyekto.	Will the project push through even if it has negative impacts?	All projects have plus or minus. That is why the project team thinks of ways to reduce or eliminate the negative impacts of the project.
11	Pasencio San Jose, Tribu sa Panggitna.	Daanin sa legal na proseso ang lahat; pag-aralan ang kasaysayan ng pagbaha sa Daraitan; siguruhing hindi bumaha sa Daraitan.	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Ang full supply level dapat hindi lumampas ng 160 m. Iyong lugar ng Kaliwa Dam, iyon ay humigit kumulang na 100m, para maging 160m, mga animnapu	Always make sure to follow the legal process. It is important to study also the history of flooding in Daraitan so future flooding impacts can be reduced.	The full supply level of Kaliwa Dam is 160m. The Kaliwa Dam has a depth of 100m, to make it 160m, the wall's height is 60m. We assure you, Daraitan will not be flooded due to the dam.

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
			ang taas ng pader. Hindi po aabutin ang Daraitan.		
12	Raffy Reyes, Business Group	Na-award na po ba ang proyekto?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Ang loan agreement a ma-award lamang po kung makakuha ng ECC.	Has the project been awarded?	The loan agreement will only be awarded upon the issuance of ECC.
13	Raffy Reyes, Business Group	Ano ang kasiguraduhan na may sapat na karanasan ang China Energy para gawing matibay ang dam?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Napag-aralan maigi ng NEDA Board ang proyekto at dumaan sa tamang proseso ang pagtukoy sa contractor. Kasama ang karanasan sa paggawa ng dam sa requirements ng bidding document.	What is the assurance that China Energy has the capacity and experience in developing a resilient dam?	That is part o the ECC requirements and the bidding documents - experience of the contractor.
14	Raffy Reyes, Business Group	Bakit gumagawa ng kalsada ang MWSS pabor sa paggawa ng dam?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Ang mga kalsada ay proyekto ng DPWH at hindi ng MWSS.	Why was MWSS involved in the road construction?	Road construction is under DPWH and not MWSS.
15	Engr. Carlos E. Inofre Jr., Municipal Officer, Tanay, Rizal	Possible bang mabawasan ang height ng dam pero pareho rin ang dami ng tubig?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Kung mababa ang dam, madaling mapuno ng batong maliliit ang dam. 60 metrong taas ng dam ay ang pinakaligtas na taas ng dam at pangmatagalan na makakapag-imbak ng tubig.	Can the dam height still be reduced?	If the dam has a lower wall, it can be easily filled with the sediments. To have a more sustainable water supply, the most appropriate and viable dam height is 60 m.

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
16	Engr. Carlos E. Inofre Jr., Municipal Officer, Tanay, Rizal	Bakit walang DRRM initiatives sa mga presentation (trainings, gamit, early warning device)	Engr. N.M. Ortigas & Engr. L.C. Cleofe: Kasama na sa plano ang climate change and risk assessment sa paggawa ng plan. Kasama rin ang pagpapalakas ng DRRMO ng Barangay sa pamamagitan ng trainings, equipment at early warning system	Why was there no mention about DRRM initiatives?	The plan has considered climate change risk assessment. Strengthening of the Barangay DRRMO is also part of the plan, including provision of trainings, equipment and early warning system.
17	Engr. Carlos E. Inofre Jr., Municipal Officer, Tanay, Rizal	Iyong gagawing tunnel, may identified fault line, bandang Barangay Guyambay, hindi ba delikado ito?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Sang-ayon sa aming structural geologist, maigsi lang ang fault line. Ang ibig sabihin ay hindi kumpirmadong major fault. Inaalam din kung gaano kalalim ang fault. Kasama ito sa kumpletong disenyo ng dam.	Regarding the underground tunnel, there are existing fault line near Barangay Guyambay, is this safe?	According to our structural geologist, the fault lines are short and dash lines on the map, meaning these are confirmed non-major fault lines. We are confirming the depth of these fault lines. Rest assured, these will form part of the final design.
18	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Anong kasiguruhan na susunod ang China sa standards?	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Hindi aprubahan ang disenyo at plano kung hindi sumunod sa standards	What is our assurance that China will follow the standards?	MWSS will not approve the design of the dam if it would not be according to the existing standards.

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
19	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Magkaroon ng maayos na supply ng potable water dito sa Barangay at sa buong Tanay.	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama po ito sa plano.	Include in the plan the following: assurance sufficient water supply, irrigation, sanitation and damage, safety of the sacred cemetery, 2000 affected families in Daraitan, and early warning system for Barangay Daraitan and in entire Tanay	These will all form part of the plans and programs for Daraitan and Tanay. We will review again the list of the affected families and consider the suggestions.
20	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Isama ang irigasyon sa buong Tanay sa plano	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama po ito sa plano.		
21	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Pag-aralan ang kasaysayan ng pagbaha sa Daraitan	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama po ito sa plano.		
22	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Isama sa plano ang pagsasaayos ng sanitasyon at drainage	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama po ito sa plano.		
23	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Iaayos at gawing ligtas ang sagradong sementeryo ng Daraitan.	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama po ito sa plano.		
24	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Isama ang mahigit 2000 na kabahayan sa Daraitan sa listahan ng apektadong pamilya.	Enr. L.C. Cleofas: Babalikan ulit ang listahan para maisama ang mga taga-Daraitan		
25	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Anong plano para sa early warning system sa Daraitan?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Kasama sa plano ang pagpapalakas ng Barangay DRRMO, sa pamamagitan ng		

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
			training, equipment at early warning system.		
26	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco	Sino po ang mag-operate ng dam?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: MWSS ang mangangasiwa	Who shall operate the dam?	MWSS shall operate and manage the dam.
27	Maria Clara Dullas, IPS	Idineklara na hindi public hearing ang idinaos na pagpupulong dahil sa paglabag sa NCIP guidelines at sa pagkakaroon muna ng public scoping.	(noted)	Declared that the public hearing was null and void due to failure to adhere in the NCIP guidelines and the failure to conduct public scoping.	(noted)
28	Maria Clara Dullas, IPS	Ang Laiban Dam ba ang karugtong ng Kaliwa Dam?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Hindi po. Ang Laiban Dam ay matagal nang pinatigil ng gobyerno. Hindi ito inaprubahan. Ang Kaliwa Dam lang ang inaprubahan ng NEDA Board.	Is Laiban Dam the next dam to be constructed after Kaliwa Dam?	No. The government has abandoned the construction of Laiban Dam. It was not approved. The NEDA Board only approved Kaliwa Dam Project.
29	Maria Clara Dullas, IPS	Dapat tingnan ng MWSS ang ADSDPP muna bago bumuo ng panibagong plano; Isama ang tunay na kasiguruhan ng kaunlarang pangkabuhayan sa mga katutubo, para hindi maulit ang karanasan ng IPs sa Angat Dam.		MWSS must revisit first the ADSDPP before developing a new plan for the IPs. The development of IPs must be truly integrated in the plan to avoid the sad experience of IPs in Angat Dam.	

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
30	Orlando R. Peñamante, Presidente ng Sukatan L.N. at ng Asian Farmers' Association (AFA) na binubuo ng 24 countries:	Hindi pagpapaalam sa pagkuha ng larawan sa ilog; Bakit ang sinasabi ay Kaliwa Dam pero ang ipinakita sa larawan ay sa Manggahan?		The proponents failed to request for permission to take photos at the river (as shown in the PowerPoint presentation); The proponents showed misleading photos which illustrated Manggahan, instead of the Kaliwa River.	
31	Eufemia T. Enciso, Pangulo ng IPO, Bayan ng Tanay	Kailangang sundin ng MWSS muna ang NCIP Guidelines, tungkol sa FPIC, at doon pag-usapan at magkasundo sa mga isyu ukol sa Kaliwa Dam Project		MWSS must adhere first to the NCIP guidelines and proceed with the FPIC to flesh out all issues and concerns on Kaliwa Da Project.	
32	T. Aumentado, Gen. Nakar	Sakop ng Gen. Nakar ang ilog Daraitan, pero may kasunduan ang mga katutuo para sa magkatuwang na pamamahala dito.	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco: May pag-uusap na ang Bayan ng Nakar at Tanay tungkol diyan. Ang malagang pag-usapan dito ay ang kasiguruhang hindi malulubok ang Ilog Tinipak dahil ito ay sa Lalawigan ng Rizal.	Gen. Nakar has full jurisdiction over the Daraitan River; the IPs have agreed to jointly oversee the management of the said river.	Gen. Nakar and Tanay LGU have arrangements on the matter, let this not be discussed here because our main concern here is to ensure the safety of Tinipak - that is under the jurisdiction of Rizal Province.

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
33	Demosthenes Reynera, Executive Director ng Tribal Center for Development, Kinatawan ng Diocese of Infanta, Quezon	Irerelocate ba ang mga taga-Daraitan dahil sa nakikitang panganib na dulot nila sa kalinisan ng tubig sa ilog?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Hindi na kailangang i-relocate ang mga taga-Daraitan dahil kasama sa plano ang sanitasyon at drainage, ganun din ang pagtatayo ng waste treatment plant.	Will the Daraitan resident be relocated after finding out the probable negative impact of the households to the water quality?	Relocation of the Daraitan Residents is not an option right now because the project team looks at institutionalization of sanitation, drainage and septage treatment facilities / systems instead.
34	Jenifer Gerones, Field Officer, NCIP	Ayusin maigi ang presentasyon ng proyekto para maunawaan ng mga Katutubo kapag ng FPIC; may paglabag sa batas kung pagiisahin ang IPDP at Community Development Plan dahil may espesyal na pagtangi sa mga IPs; isama ang mga tao sa Daraitan sa mga apektado ng Kaliwa Dam; Kailangang i-check sa sagradong sementeryo. Kailangang hindi ito lulubog.	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Aayusin ang presentasyon para sa FPIC; titingnan muli ang IPDP nang naaayon sa umiiral na batas ng IPs	Revise the presentation that explains well to the IPs once the FPIC begins; fusion of IPDP under the Community Development plan violates the existing laws on IP Rigts; Include the Daraitan households in the list of affected families as presented; Ensure to keep the cemetery safe and will not be submerged.	We will revise the presentation for the FPIC process; we will revisit the IPDP based on the existing IP laws.
35	Conrado Vargas, Infanta	May FPIC ba sa 10-year watershed management project.	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Wala po, dahil ang aming kakontrata ay ang LGU ng Gen. Nakar.	Has the proponent secured the necessary FPIC on the 10-year watershed management project?	None at the moment because the MOA of MWSS is with Gen. Nakar LGU.

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
36	Conrado Vargas, Infanta	Iyong mga pag-aaral, update-update lang, kailangan pa rin pong kumuha ng Gratuitous Permit.	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: Kailangan lang ito sa scientific research at kung mag-export ng samples.	Insisted on the need to secure a Gratuitous Permit.	This is only a requirement for scientific research or when samples would be exported.
37	Efren Danao, Sr., Kagawad, Barangay Daraitan	Bakit hindi magsurvey ulit, para masigurado na talagang hindi kami apektado. Ang nais ko ay maprotektahan ang aming barangay (e.g. breakwater).	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Isasama ng contractor ang breakwater sa disenyo.	Suggested to have another round of survey, together with the representatives of IPs, to ensure that Daraitan will really not be submerged; Ensure that the Daraitan people will receive the appropriate benefits from the project.	The contractor will include the breakwater in the design; regarding the survey, there might be misunderstanding if it would be done by non-professionals; the design will definitely ensure the safety of Daraitan at all times.
38	Efren Danao, Sr., Kagawad, Barangay Daraitan	Isama ang mga katutubo sa pagsusukat muli ng elevation sa Daraitan; siguruhin ang benepisyo para sa kapakanan ng mga tao sa Daraitan.	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Sa pagsurvey, kailangan na propesyonal ang gumawa nito baka magkaroon ng kalituhan. Kasama sa disenyo at programa na hindi maapektuhan ang Barangay Daraitan.		
39	Nila Grace O. Pranada, IPMR	Noon po bang gumawa ng Feasibility Study, kumuha ba ng FPIC	Octavio: Walang kinukuhang kahit ano sa akin.	When the Feasibility Study was done, was FPIC secured from the IPS?	Nothing was requested from me.
40	Nila Grace O. Pranada, IPMR	Dapat ibibigay ninyo ang mga dokumento sa NCIP na siyang magbababa sa mga katutubo.	Marilou Tablo: Hindi lang ito usapin ng mga katutubo, ang Kaliwa Dam Project ay usapin ng lahat ng mamamayan sa	All documents should have been submitted first to NCIP, then transmitted to us.	This is not only an issue with the IPs, but by all Daraitan constituents. Reminded everyone to stay calm and prioritize what is best for all.

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
			barangay. Kaya dapat maging mahinahon at magpaliwanagan ang bawat isa. Unahin ang tunay na makakabuti para sa lahat.		
41	Armeya, Barangay Sto. Niño, Member ng IP Political Structure	Alisin ang "New Centennial Water Source" sa pamagat ng proyekto at gawing direktang "Kaliwa Dam Project" lamang.	Vice Mayor R.A. Tanjuatco: Gawing rekomendasyon sa pulong na ito ang pagtanggap ng "New Centennial Water Source" sa pamagat ng proyekto upang maiwasan ang agam-agam at pagkalito ng mga tao.	Remove "New Centennial Water Source" from the title and indicate only "Kaliwa Dam Project"	Let it be the recommendation from today's public hearing to adopt and reflect only "Kaliwa Dam Project" to avoid confusion among the community members.
42	Clarita D.C. Armea, IPs, Barangay Sto. Niño	Anong kasiguruhanamin na ang Laiban Dam ay hindi n tutuloy.	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Ang Kaliwa Dam na may 28km na tunnel, at hindi Laiban Dam ang inaprubahan ng NEDA Board.	What assurance can we have that Laiban will never push through?	NEDA Board only approved Kaliwa Dam with a 28-meter tunnel and not Laiban Dam.
43	Marcelino Tena, Sagibin LN, Gen. Nakar	Pag-aralan muli ang plano at siguruhing igalang ang aming batas at kultura, pati ang batas ng kalikasan.		Revisit the plan again and make sure that our laws, culture and laws of nature are all taken into account.	
44	Willy Manlapaz, Tour Guide Founder of Daraitan	Anong livelihood ang binigay? Hindi pwedeng isantabi lang ang turismo dito sa Tinipak.	Engr. N.M. Ortigas: May ginagawang development plan, it is part of the project.		

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
45	Willy Manlapaz, Tour Guide Founder of Daraitan	Sino ang makukulong at mananagot sakaling may problema?	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Ang mananagot po dito ay MWSS. At hahabulin namin ang contractor at ang consultant namin kung mali ang pagsupervise. Lahat ng pag-iingat at regulasyon ay susundin. Ang ahensya po ang inyong idedemanda. Proyekto po ang inyong ihahabla.		
46	Maria Clara Dullas, IPS	Kung sakali po na itatayo ninyo ang dam, at ito ay masisira at papatay ng maraming tao, sino sa MWSS ang pwedeng idemanda?			
47	Leonardo De La Cruz, Barangay Captain, Barangay Sto. Niño, Tanay, Rizal	Kapag ba dumalo na sa Cluster 1, hindi na pwedeng dumalo sa Cluster 2?	Jenifer Gerones, NCIP: Masyadong marami kapag sabay-sabay na dumalo sila. Pwede pa ring magsalita sa ibang cluster kung gustong dumalo doon, basta hindi lang maapektuhan ang pagdedesisyon ng ibang cluster.	If we attended Cluster 1 (referring to FPIC), are will still allowed to participate in Cluster 2?	IPs were clustered due to have more effective discussion on the issues concerning them such as Kaliwa Dam Project; IPs from other clusters can still participate in another cluster, but must not affect the decision of such clusters.

		TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
No.	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
48	Conrado Vargas, Infanta	Pakibalikan ang interview sa CNN, March 22, kay Sir Velasco at Usec. Lambino. Silang dalawa ang nagsabi na 5 hanggang 6 na taon lamang. Ang iso-source out po ay Kanan Dam pagkatapos ng Kaliwa Dam.	Engr. L.C. Cleofas: Kung 5 taon lang po ang Kaliwa Dam, hindi ito aaprubahan ng NEDA. Ang Angat Dam ay 1968 itinatag at hanggang ngayon ay matatag pa. I-clarify muna namin itong impormasyon.	Referred to the CNN interview of Usec. Velasco and Usec. Lambino who announced that the Kaliwa Dam Project will only be up to 6 years, then water supply will be sourced out from Kanan Dam.	If the Kaliwa Dam is only up to 5 years it would not be approved by NEDA Board given the immense investment of the government; Angat Dam was established in 1968 and is still working. We will clarify the said information first.

## 5 FORUM OUTPUTS

- Revisit the list of the affected households as presented to include the 2,000 families in Daraitan
- Conduct of FPIC on 04 September 2019 at the Barangay of Daraitan
- Revise the Project Presentation for the FPIC Process
- Revisit the Indigenous People Development Plan, ensuring the adherence to the existing customary laws and government laws that govern the IPs.
- Include in the plan the following:
  - Safety of the cemetery of Daraitan
  - Water supply for Barangay Daraitan and Tanay
  - Septage treatment and drainage for Barangay Daraitan
  - Safety of the Tinipak River, the sacred spring and the tourist sites in Daraitan
  - Disaster Risk Reduction and Mangement Plan, particularly the early warning and evacuation schemes
  - Capacity building programs for Daraitan DRRMO
  - Appropriate and sustainable Livelihood Program
- Revise the project title from “The New Centennial Water Source – Kaliwa Dam Project” into “The Kaliwa Dam Project”
- Clarify the information on the life span of Kaliwa Dam
- Adherence to the NCIP Guidelines

- Submission of the public hearing documentation to DENR-EMB with the following details and attachment:
  - Attendance sheets (Gen. Nakar, Teresa, Infanta, Tanay)
  - Written, video and audio documentation
  - Segregated comments based on land, water, air and people, including the details on who raised what and the response of the MWSS
  - Verbatim account on the Open Forum

## **6 ADJOURNMENT**

Engr. L. Ramboyong adjourned the public hearing at 2:30 p.m. He encouraged everyone to provide additional inputs and to raise other concerns that were not tackled at the hearing through the EMB website and contact numbers:

Website: [eia@emb.gov.ph](mailto:eia@emb.gov.ph)

Telephone numbers: (02) 920-2240, (02) 920-2241

On a final note, Engr. L. Ramboyong reminded the participants that the presented project is still subject for review before the release of its Environmental Compliance Certificate.

## **7 ANNEXES**

### **ANNEX 1: ATTENDANCE SHEET OF STAKEHOLDERS AND GENERAL PUBLIC**

### **ANNEX 2: DISSEMINATION OF INFORMATION**

Annex 2.1: Affidavit of Publication

Annex 2.2: Publication in Newspaper of General Circulation

Annex 2.3: Notice of Public Hearing

Annex 2.4: Posting in Public Areas

Annex 2.5: Invitation Letters

### **ANNEX 3: PUBLIC HEARING PROCEEDINGS**

Annex 3.1: Matrix of Issues Raised and the Proponent's/DENR Response

Annex 3.2: Summary of Issues beyond the mandate of the EMB

Annex 3.3: Transcription of Proceedings

### **ANNEX 4: VIDEO, PHOTO AND AUDIO DOCUMENTATION**

Annex 4.1: Video Footages & Audio Recordings

Annex 4.2: Photographs

### **ANNEX 5: POWERPOINT PRESENTATION OF THE PROJECT AND EIA STUDY**