



The New Centennial Water Source –
Kaliwa Dam Project

PUBLIC HEARING
IN GENERAL NAKAR, QUEZON

Covered Court

23 AUGUST 2019

9:00 a.m. – 1:30 p.m.

06 SEPTEMBER 2019



TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	LOCATION AND TIME	2
2	PREPARATION	2
3	PURPOSE OF THE PUBLIC HEARING	2
4	HIGHLIGHTS OF THE PUBLIC HEARING.....	2
4.1	PRESENTATION ON THE PROJECT DETAILS BY ENGR. JOSE ESCOTO OF MWSS...	3
4.2	SALIENT POINTS ON THE KALIWA DAM PROJECT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT (EIA) BY ENGR. NOEL M. ORTIGAS OF EDCOP	4
4.3	SUMMARY OF ISSUES / CONCERNS RAISED AT THE OPEN FORUM	5
5	FORUM OUTPUTS	18
6	ADJOURNMENT.....	19
7	ANNEXES.....	20

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 1. SUMMARY OF ISSUES / CONCERNS / INTERESTS RAISED AT THE PUBLIC HEARING	5
---	---

1 LOCATION AND TIME

This is the first Public Hearing for the project, entitled, “The New Centennial Water Source – Kaliwa Dam Project”. This was held on 23 August 2019 at the Covered Courts of General Nakar, Quezon, from 9:00 a.m. – 1:30 p.m.

2 PREPARATION

The preparatory activities for this Public Hearing included informing the stakeholders about the event through publication in the newspaper and general circulation, posting of tarpaulins in conspicuous places within the municipality, personal invitation and dissemination through phone calls and text messages. Based on the Affidavit of Publication as presented in Annex 1, the Notice of the Public Hearing was published in Philippine Star on 8 and 15 of August 2019.

There was close coordination with the local government unit (LGU) and all key stakeholders, IP leaders, law enforcement officers, and other constituents in the locality for the preparation of this public hearing.

ANNEX 1: COPY OF THE ATTENDANCE SHEET

3 PURPOSE OF THE PUBLIC HEARING

The main objective of the Public Hearing was to provide an in-depth discussion on the project details and the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) study on Kaliwa Dam Project. The participants were enjoined to provide feedback and opinions as regards the provided presentations, as well as their issues and concerns. In order to properly document the public hearing, the proponent prepared video and audio recorders to capture the proceedings.

4 HIGHLIGHTS OF THE PUBLIC HEARING

The Public Hearing was called to order at 9:30 a.m. with Engr. L. Remboyong of DENR presiding. Pastor D.B. Jimenez of the Door of Faith Church let the Opening Prayer and was

followed by the singing of Lupang Hinirang. Mayor E. Rozul and Engr. L. Cleofas of MWSS welcomed the participants to the public forum.

Atty. J.E. Ang recognized the agencies and institutions that were present at the Public Hearing. A total of 438 participants, with 236 male and 202 females, attended the public hearing. Engr. C.V. Arida of EMB Central Office provided a brief orientation on the purpose of the Public Hearing and emphasized that the all inputs of the participants will be taken as a substantial material in consideration of the proponent's application for the Environmental Compliance Certificate (ECC). This was followed by the Rules on the Conduct of Public Hearing as presented by Atty. J.E. Ang as the Public Hearing Officers

ANNEX 2: NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC

A motion to defer the public hearing was raised by Atty. Aaron Pedrosa of Sanlakas and was supported by Ian Rivera of the Philippine Movement for Climate Justice. This was seconded also by a Dumagat – Remontado Community Leader – Conchita Calzado. The parties questioned the validity of the public hearing given the failure to provide a copy of proof of publication in the general newspaper or the Affidavit of Publication issued by the Editor-in-Chief of a newspaper and the failure to provide hard copies of the Notice of Public Hearing to the primary stakeholders.

Atty. J.E. Ang eventually ruled to proceed with the Public Hearing as scheduled and requested those parties who insisted on the deferment of the Public Hearing to instead submit a position paper to DENR-EMB for appropriate action.

Atty. A. Pedrosa, et al, and all the participants who wanted the public hearing to be postponed walked-out the Gen. Nakar Covered Courts. About 250 individuals were present during the Open Forum.

4.1 PRESENTATION ON THE PROJECT DETAILS BY ENGR. JOSE ESCOTO OF MWSS

Engr. J. Escoto highlighted in his presentation the mandate of MWSS to provide sufficient and safe potable water in the areas covered by MWSS, such as Metro Manila, Rizal, Cavite and Bulacan. He emphasized that the establishment of Kaliwa Dam can greatly serve, not only the target consumers of the MWSS, but also the communities within the vicinity of the dam given the social and economic benefits that the project can bring into the locality. He cited the

continuous efforts of MWSS, in partnership with EDCOP, to surface all issues and concerns of the public regarding the Kaliwa Dam towards achieving a more sustainable future for the indigenous people (IP) in Quezon and Rizal. He also mentioned that the development of a dam ensures continuous efforts to make the watershed flourish and to institutionalize clean and healthy environment for the people of the target project sites. He assured the participants that the risks that accompany the construction and operations of the dam shall be mitigated, and that the people, particularly the indigenous tribes are at the heart of this endeavour.

4.2 SALIENT POINTS ON THE KALIWA DAM PROJECT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT (EIA) BY ENGR. NOEL M. ORTIGAS OF EDCOP

Engr. N.M. Ortigas mainly focused on the structural details of the dam, including the results of their assessment on the land, air, water, community aspects of the project. He also cited several issues that were raised in the previous dialogues with the community members such as the risk of flooding, the degradation of the environment due to the construction of the dam and some issues on resettlement and relocation of the communities which will be directly affected by the project.

He also underscored that the major feature of the EIA study included the development of the Social Development Program which is composed of three packages: (1) LARP – Land Acquisition and Resettlement Program (LARP); (2) IP Development Plan; and, (3) Community Development Plan. On his concluding remarks, he sincerely expressed his high hopes with the target communities to be one with the project, because without the support from the community members and leaders, the Kaliwa Dam project will not be able to sustain the flourishing environment and biodiversity for the current and future generations.

He emphasized the importance of “benefit-sharing” mechanism, where the community members become part of the entire operations of the Kaliwa Dam, given their major role in the Watershed Protection and Management Program which will be formulated in consultation with them. Engr. N.M. Ortigas informed the participants also that the copy of the maps and presentations will be made available at the Office of the Municipal Mayor – Hon. Eliseo Rozul.

ANNEX 5: COPY OF THE PROJECT PRESENTATION AND EIA STUDY ON KALIWA DAM

4.3 SUMMARY OF ISSUES / CONCERNS RAISED AT THE OPEN FORUM

The major areas that were raised at the Open Forum included risks of flooding, resettlement and relocation sites and programs, ancestral domains, protection and preservation of sacred sites in Tinipak River, presence of hot springs, National Greening Program (NGP) sites, compensation of IPs who would be affected by the project, and the watershed protection and management. Most of the participants who articulated their concerns were community leaders, somewhere chieftains in their respective areas and others were representatives of their tribes.

The summary of issues and concerns raised are presented on Table 1.

Table 1. Summary of Issues / Concerns / Interests Raised at The Public Hearing

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
1	Atty. Aaron Pedrosa, Secretary General, Sanlakas	Humiling na ipakita ng proponent ang katibayan na nailathala ang Notice of the Public Hearing sa diyaryo at katibayan na namigay ng mga sulat sa mga pangunahing katutubo na maapektuhan ng dam, pitong araw bago ang mismong public hearing.	(Engr. J.Escoto) Nagpakita sa screen ng lista kung kailan nailathala sa Philippine Star ang Notice of the Public Hearing.	Requested the proponents to provide proofs on the publication of the Notice of the Public Hearing in the newspaper and on the receipt of letter by the primary stakeholders of the project.	(Engr. J.Escoto) Showed on screen the date which the Notice was published in Philippine Star.
2	Atty Aaron Pedrosa, Sanlakas	Iginiit na kailangang 'hard copy' ang ipakita sa mga tao bago ituloy ang public hearing.	(Engr. C.V. Arida) Alinsunod sa DAO 2003-30 at 2017-15 ang ginawang pagatahala ng Notice of Public Hearing	Reiterated that hard copy of proofs must be presented first to the participants before the Public Hearing can proceed	(Engr. C.V. Arida) Affirmed that the publication of the said Notice has complied with the guidelines of DAO 2003-30 and 2017-15.

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
3	Nanay Conchita Calzado, Dumagat-Remontado	Nanindigan na kailangang masunod ang proseso ng maayos upang magkaroon ng kaayusan ang public hearing. Tumutol na ipagpatuloy ang public hearing kung walang maipakitang katibayan na nasunod ang panuntunan sa paglalathala ng Notice of Public Hearing. Kahapon lang sila nasabihan tungkol sa public hearing na ito.	(Atty. J.E. Ang) Kung mayroong depekto ang proseso ngayon, uulitin ang public hearing na ito. Ngunit hayaan nating makita ng mga tao ang pinaghirapang EIA study para higit na maunawaan ang proyekto.	Asserted that the Public Hearing must not push through if the procedures were flawed in the first place. She strongly felt their need to be involved in the process, and thus, must proceed as stated in the existing guidelines. Their tribe was only informed yesterday.	(Atty. J.E. Ang) Assured the public that the proponent will re-do the entire process once proven that there was a violation on the guidelines regarding the publication of the Notice of Public Hearing. He appealed to the public to let the process flow as planned so as to have better understanding on the project based on the report of the EIA Study.
4	Atty Aaron Pedrosa, Sanlakas	Nais na gawing pormal ang pagtutol na magpatuloy ang public hearing dahil sa mga isyu na nabanggit.	(Atty. J.E. Ang) Nauunawaan ang opinyon ng Ginoo, ngunit nais na ipagpatuloy na ang pagtalakay sa proyekto.	Formalized the strong opposition to push through with the public hearing due to failure to present substantial proof as requested.	(Atty. J.E. Ang) Respected the opinion of the group but was firm to proceed with the public hearing as scheduled.
5	Ian Rivera, Philippine Movement for Climate Justice	Anong halaga ng pagpapatuloy ng public hearing kung hindi naman naaayon sa simula pa lang ang panuntunang pinapatupad dito?	(Atty. J.E. Ang) Na-satisfy naman ang katibayan na may nangyaring posting.	What is the value of this public hearing if it was already flawed at the beginning?	(Atty. J.E. Ang) Based on the documents, there was really proof of posting of the Notice of Hearing.

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
6	Ian Rivera, Philippine Movement for Climate Justice	Importante ang pagpapakita ng totoong Affidavit of Publication ngayon dahil pwede namang madaya gamit ang Adobe Photoshop ang mga soft copies. Jurisdictional requirement ito kaya questionable ang proseso.		It is important to show hard copy of the Affidavit of Publication today before the public hearing proceeds. Soft copies can be recreated through Adobe Photoshop. This is a jurisdictional requirement that is why the process is questionable.	
7	Atty. Aaron Pedrosa, Sanlakas	Kung walang maipakitang kaibayan ngayon, mas maganda na i-suspend ang public hearing na ito.	(Atty. J.E. Ang) May sariling procedure ang korte, at may procedure din ang EMB. Tama ang inyong nasabi tungkol sa universal rule ng jurisdiction.	If the proponent could not provide now the requested documents, it is might be proper to suspend the public hearing.	(Atty. J.E. Ang) The court has its rules; likewise, EMB follows its rules as well. Acknowledged the point raised about the jurisdiction as a universal rule.
8		(Panandaliang nag-uusap ang mga kinatawan ng Sanlakas, DENR, Public Hearing Officer at MWSS)		(The representatives of DENR, Sanlakas, DENR and MWSS are discussing in front, off the microphone.)	
9	Atty. J.E. Ang	Nanindigan na ipagpatuloy ang Public Hearing nang naayon sa plano. Lahat ng may pagtutol ay maaaring magpasa ng 'position paper' sa tanggapan ng DENR.	(Magpapasa nalang ng position paper ang tumututol na grupo na ituloy ang public hearing. Umalis ang grupo ng Sanlakas, kasama ang ilang miyembro ng mga Dumagat-Remontado, at pang taga-suprota gaya ng Philippine Movement on	Ruled to proceed with the public hearing. All parties with strong opposition on this may submit a position paper to the office of DENR EMB.	(The group with strong reservations for the public hearing to push through agreed to submit a position paper, as instructed by Atty. J.E. Ang. The opposition left the venue, together with some members of the Dumagat-Remontado group and other

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
			Climate Change Justice.)		supporters, such as the Philippine Movement for Climate Change Justice)
10	Ian Rivera, Philippine Movement for Climate Justice	Kung hindi masubstantiate the procedure for public hearing, why are we proceeding with the public hearing. Ang Affidavit ay isang kinakailangang sangkap upang magpatuloy ang pagdinig sa publiko .	Tulad ng ibinigay na patunay na isinumite sa amin, nasubstantiate naman po.	If the procedure for public hearing cannot be substantiated, why are we proceeding with the public hearing. The Affidavit is a necessary substance for the public hearing to proceed.	As provided by the proof submitted to us, it was substantiated.
12	Isang Lalaking Kagawad - Barangay Daraitan	Ayon po sa sinabi nila, 2.5 meters ang taas ng tubig kung may dam. Paano namin masisiguro ang kabuhayan ng aming mga guide at hindi lulubog ang mga tourist spots sa aming lugar?	(NMO -EDCOP) Tumataas talaga ang tubig sa ilog kahit wala pong dam. Ang positive effect ng dam, kapag mahina ang tubig na dumadaloy sa ilog, nag-iimbak siya ng tubig. Kapag maraming tubig naman, may spillway at papadaluyin naman sa Agos River ang tubig. Magiging bahagi ang inyong pamayanan sa lahat ng konsultasyon hinggil sa bagay na iyan.	How can we be sure that the water level in Daraitan will not go beyond the 2.5meter buffer as per presentation?	(NMO -EDCOP) Even without a dam, Daraitan is prone to drastic rise of water level. The positive thing about the dam is that the rate of water flow can now be controlled. Excess water will be directed to its spillway, causing a safer release of water back to Agos River. Your community will be involved in the consultation process to discuss that matter.

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
13	Isang Lalaking Kagawad - Barangay Daraitan	Ang karamihan ng mga tao sa Daraitan ay nakasalalay sa turismo. Nag-aalala ang mga tao na ang dam ay magiging sanhi ng baha sa lugar at malulunod ang mga turista na lugar tulad ng Tinipak Cave at iba pa. Ipinahayag niya ang kanyang mga inaasahan sa koponan ng proyekto na magkaroon ng pag-aaral sa thorough sa pagsasaalang-alang na ito at matiyak na ang komunidad sa Daraitan ay magkakaroon ng mas ligtas na buhay at mga pag-aari kahit na sa pagkakaroon ng dam.	(EDCORP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Ang mga alalahanin at komento ng ginoo ay maayos na nakuha. Tiniyak niya sa kanila na ang nasabing komunidad ay magiging bahagi ng lahat ng mga konsultasyon at mga pagpapalano para sa dam.	Majority of the people in Daraitan depends on tourism. The people worry that the dam will cause the area to flood and will drown the tourist spots like the Tinipak Cave and others. He expressed his expectations to the project team to have a thorough study in this regard and ensure that the community in Daraitan will have safer lives and properties even in the presence of the dam.	(EDCORP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) The concerns and comments of the gentleman were properly taken. He assured them that the said community will be part of all the consultations and planning activities for the dam.
14	Bayani Azcarraga, Sitio Sablan, Daraitan, Tanay, Rizal	Kung sakali ang mga tao na maapektuhan ng dam, at sila ay ililipat sa isang isang lugar, gagawan po ba to ng kalsada para sa kapakanan ng katutubo?	(MWSS) Syempre po sa resettlement site, kasama po ang kalsada. Kasama po ang access road sa plano.	In the event that we have to be relocated, will we also be provided with access road?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Yes, the resettlement site will have access roads. That is also part of the plan.
15	Bayani Azcarraga, Sitio Sablan, Daraitan, Tanay, Rizal	Pinaalala sa mga proponents na ang ancestral domain ay isang napakahalagang aspeto na kailangang tingnan kapag pinagpaplanuhan ang resettlement ng	(MWSS-Engr. Jun Escoto) Walang pamayanan ang maaaring maapektuhan ng dam nang hindi dumadaan sa konsultasyon.	Reminded the proponents that the ancestral domains to which the people belong are very important aspects in resettlement planning and development.	(MWSS-Engr. Jun Escoto) There will be no community that will be displaced without proper consultation.

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
		mga apektadong pamilya ng dam.			
16	Bayani Azcarraga, Sitio Sablan, Daraitan, Tanay, Rizal	Makakatanggap ba ng bayad ang mga taong may pananim na maaapektuhan ng dam? Mayroon din bang porsyento ang mga katutubo sa kabayaran ibibigay sa mga Tagalog dahil di hamak na mas malawak ang kanilang lupang sakahan kaysa sa amin?	(MWSS-Engr. Jun Escoto) Mayroon pong kabayaran matatanggap ang mga maapektuhan ng dam; (Atty. J.E. Ang) Ang NCIP ang makakasagot sa sumunod na tanong.	He inquired about the payment for those who are farming in the areas that will be affected by the dam.	Will the affected families receive compensation for the removal of their crops due to dam construction? Will we have a percentage on the payment that the Tagalog group shall receive, given that they farm within the ancestral domain?
17	Bayani Azcarraga, Sitio Sablan, Daraitan, Tanay, Rizal	Ang pangkat ng Tagalog ay sumasakop sa maraming mga bukid kaysa sa mga katutubo. Magkakaroon ba ng porsyento ang mga katutubo mula sa pagbabayad na matatanggap ng mga Tagalog?	(Atty. E.Ang) Ang nasabing pag-aalala ay pinakamahusay na mai-tackle sa isang forum sa mga kinatawan ng National Commission on Indigenous People (NCIP).	The Tagalog group covers more farmlands than the indigenous people. Will the indigenous people have a percentage from the payment that the Tagalog will receive?	(Atty. E.Ang) The said concern will be best tackled in a forum with the National Commission on Indigenous People (NCIP) representatives.
18	Henry Goreo, Sitio Baybay, Brgy. Sablang, Gen. Nakar	Paano po na magagarantiya ng proponent, ng may project, na iyong aming, magiging kapalit ng aming masisirang kalikasan, iyong ilog, ay magiging habang buhay din naming pakikinabangan.	(Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Nakapaloob sa planong ito ang benepisyo ng mga katutubo: IP Development Plan, Community Development Plan at Land Acquisition Resettlement Plan - ang magsisiguro na matutugunan ang mga	What is our guarantee that our benefits from the environmental degradation brought by the dam will be on a long-term basis.?	(MWSS) The benefits of the IP are indicated in the three plans: IP Development Plan, Community Development Plan at Land Acquisition Resettlement Plan. MWSS will not allow unfair treatment of any individual in the process. IPs are

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
			pangangailangan ng IPs. Hindi po papayag iyong MWSS at ang Pamahalaan para madehado ang sinuman. Kabahagi ang mga katutubo sa Watershed Management Program.		part of the Watershed Management Program.
19	Henry Goreo, Sitio Baybay, Brgy. Sablang, Gen. Nakar	Paano kami magiging kasama sa pag-unlad?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Makikipag-ugnayan sina G. Verda and G. Linda para maging kabahagi ang ginoo sa proseso ng pag-unlad; (Engr. J. Escoto) Ang mga katutubo ang tunay na susi upang maging matagumpay ang dam sa lugar.	How can they become part of the development process?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Ms. Verda and Ms. Linda will coordinate with them to ensure that they will be part of the development process; (Engr. J. Escoto) The dam will never be successful without the full support and cooperation from the community.
20	Thelma Aumentado, IP Municipal Rep., Sitio Masla, Brgy. Sablang, Gen. Nakar	Mayroon po bang mitigating measures na pwedeng gawin para hindi po lumubog ang aming mga sagradong lugar, lalo na sa Tinipak?	(Engr. R.J. Ayson) Maaari pong magkaroon ng dam na maliit para maiwasan po ang kanyang pag ulbok kung panahon ng pagbaha.	What could be the possible mitigating measures to protect our sacred sites in Tinipak?	(Engr. R.J. Ayson) A mini dam can be erected before the sacred sites for protection in times of floods.

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
21	Thelma Aumentado, IP Municipal Rep., Sitio Masla, Brgy. Sablang, Gen. Nakar	Baka naman pwedeng pagusapan nalang namin sa tribu namin na sumang-ayon sa mas mataas na lugar, dahil okupado na ng mga Tagalog ang medyo mababang lugar. Hinggil dito, kaysa bayaran ang mga Tagalog para lisanin ang kanilang lupain, idagdag nalang po sa aming tribo ang halagang ibibigay sana sa mga Tagalog. Makakatulong ang halaga na ito sa aming tribo.	(Engr. R.J. Ayson) May lugar kaming tinitingnan para maibalik sa gobyerno ang lugar na ito para dito ilipat. Naghahanap din kami ng malilipatang lugar na malapit lapit po sa inyo.	Maybe we can discuss this in our tribe and agree to opt for a higher settlement area because the lower areas have been occupied by the Tagalog people. Given this, if the proponents opt to pay the Tagalog to give-up their land just for us to settle there, it would be better if the said amount would be given to our tribe instead to the Tagalog. Any amount can be of great help to our people.	(Engr. R.J. Ayson) Other sites are being assessed now for possible options. The stakeholders will be definitely consulted on this matter before transferring to the said site.
22	Thelma Aumentado, IP Municipal Rep., Sitio Masla, Brgy. Sablang, Gen. Nakar	Paano po isasaalang-alang ang ancestral domain sa pagbuo ng watershed management plan? Ito po ba ay papailalim doon sa PAMB ng DENR o lahat ng binaggit kanina ay Gen. Nakar at Tanay ang may management. Ito po bang management ay ia-under doon o per municipality.”	(EMB Representative) Mahalagang tingnan ang pangangailangan ng IPs sa lugar kapag gagawa ng Protected Area Management Plan. Lahat ng gawait ay kailangan ding dumaan sa Free and Prior Informed Consent (FPIC), bukodpa ito sa clearance na ilalabas ng Protected Area Management Bureau (PAMB). Ang pagbuo ng Watershed	On watershed management, she asked regarding the consideration of the current set-up under the Ancestral Domain Management Plan and ADSTPP of NCOP in the formulation of a Watershed Management Plan. She requests for clarification if the management of the watershed would be per municipality or per ancestral domain management?	(EMB Representative) It is important to consider the concerns of all IPs in the area when formulating a Protected Area Management Plan. All activities in the protected areas need to undergo the Free and Prior Informed Consent (FPIC) of IPs. This is in addition to the clearance that will be issued by the Protect Area Management Board. Thus, if it

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
			Management Plan ay kailangang naaayon sa ADSTPP at PAMB.		is necessary to develop a Watershed Management Plan, the provisions stated herein need to comply with the ADSTPP and PAMB.
23	Thelma Aumentado	Doon po sa nabanggit na MOA ng LGU ng Infanta at General Nakar, sa paggawa ng IP plan, maaari po bang huwag naman tingnan ang kagyat na pangangailangan namin at tanungin naman kami sa aming pangangailangan para sa kapakinabangan ng aming salinlahi?	(Bobbi Cleofas, MWSS) Magkakaroon ng workshop kasama ang PAMB para sa Watershed Protection and Livelihood Program. Lahat po ay makakatanggap ng imbitasyon.	With regards to the MOA between Infanta and General Nakar LGU, we demand that our needs will not be belittled, rather we should be asked first of our needs for the benefit of the future generation of our people.	(Bobbi Cleofas, MWSS) A workshop at PAMB regarding the Watershed Protection and Livelihood Program is underway. She assured everyone that invitations will be released to all concerned individuals.
24	Thelma Aumentado	Bilang sagot sa tugot ni Engr. B. Cleofas, ang nasabing workshop ay isali naman po kami, at hindi lang iyong Technical Working Group ang nagdedesisyon. Kapag po Ingles na ang salita, tupi na po	(MWSS-Engr. Bobbi Cleofas) Ang gusto talaga ni RD Gonzales ay kasama kayo sa workshop. Naghahanap lang po ng tamang iskedyul.	As a follow-up to the response of Engr. B. Cleofas, it was suggested that the workshop should be more participatory instead of just involving a Technical Working Group (TWG). She emphasized that her	(MWSS-Engr. Bobbi Cleofas) She replied that RD Gonzales is eyeing T. Aumentado as one of the workshop participants. She added that her group is now

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
		ang aming mga miyembro. F		tribe members become timid when the conversation is already in English.	looking for a feasible schedule for all.
25	(Male participant), Brgy. Capt - Daraitan, Tanay	Gaano po ba talaga kataas ang harang?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Ang pader ay may taas na 60 metro.	Asked regarding the height of the wall to be constructed (referring to the dam)	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) The wall has a height of 60 meters.
26	(Male participant), Brgy. Capt - Daraitan, Tanay	Ano ang kaibahan nito sa sinasabing mungkahi na 7 metro na taas ng pader at kayang makapag-deliver ng 50 million liters a day?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Iyon pong 7 meters, ang tawag po ay Low Kaliwa Dam. Kapag malakas ang tubig, maraming dalang sediments iyon – batong maliliit, burak. Wala pang isang taon puno iyon. Ngayon bakit 60m ang Kaliwa Dam, hindi mapupuno ng 15 years ang dam.	What is the difference of the proposed 60-meter dam with the proposed 7-meter dam that can delivery 50 million liters a day?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) The 7-meter dam was called as the Low Kaliwa Dam. If the water rushes, it carries sediments, small stones and mud with it. In less than a year, that dam will overflow already. With a 60-meter dam, it is safe even for 15 years.
27	Ginoong Potenya, Barangay Pamplona	Kung bubuksan ang sinasabing spillway ng dam, gaano kataas dito sa baba ang tubig.	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) May spillway ang Kaliwa Dam. At ito ay may "Log Trap" na huhuli sa mga troso o ano mang dumi sa tubig na maaaring bumara sa dam. Kung kaya hindi magbabaha basta-basta sa inyong lugar.	Raised the concern on the possible effect of the spillway in Infanta. He asked how high the water can become once the spillway releases water.	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) The spillway has a feature called "Log Trap" which captures logs and other solid elements that may block the waterways. The water that will be released by the spillway is already clean and the release is gradual and not destructive.

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
28	Atty. Ang, Public Officer	Saan pupunta ang tubig mula sa spillway?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Mula sa spillway, ang tubig ay dadaloy papuntang Agos River.	Follow-up question on the spillway: Where will the water from the spillway go?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) The spillway will return the water to Agos River.
29	Ginoong Potenya, Barangay Pamplona	Mayroon po bang counterpart na Filipino engineers na sasama sa Chinese contractor na siyang mag do-double check sa kalidad ng dam?	(MWSS-Engr. J. Escoto) May mga consultants' ng EDCOP na on-board na po sa proyekto. Naaayon po sa mga standards ang gagawing dam, at inaasahang higit pa sa minimum standards ang gagawin ng contractor.	Does the Chinese contractor involve Filipino engineers to double check the quality of the dam?	(MWSS-Engr. J. Escoto) There are EDCOP consultants who are already on-board. The dam will be constructed based on the standards and is expected to exceed the minimum standards set forth by the existing policies.
30	Marite Ritwal, Barangay Banglos	Nangangamba na maulit ang matitinding baha na kaniyang naranasan sa mga nakaraang taon. May pangamba rin siya sa maaaring pagkawasak ng dam dulot ng tindi ng hagupit ng kalikasan.	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Patitingnan muli ang Barangay Banglos upang masuri ang maaaring epekto ng dam.	She was worried on the possible occurrence of another flood once the construction of the dam has started. She was also worried that the dam might collapse due to environmental causes.	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) He assured M. Ritwal that his team will have her location checked again and determine the risks of being flooded.
31	Chieftain (Male), Sitio Cablao, Barangay Pagsangahan	Ang isa pong aming hinihiling ay sana po ay makasama naman ang mga katutubo din sa panghabang-buhay na benepisyo.	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Sa gagawing Community Development Plan, lahat ay kasama. Pati sa Watershed Management at Environmental Protection and Management Plan,	We only hope that we will be included in the livelihood programs under the dam project.	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas): Everyone will form part of the Community Development Plan, Watershed Management Plan and the Environmental Protection and

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
			makakaasa kayong kasali kayo.		Management Plan.
32	Atty. J.E. Andrada, Public Hearing Officer	Ipinakita ang katibaya na nai-publish sa pahayagan ang Notice para sa Public Hearing na naging usapan kanina bago magpatuloy ang public hearing. Ito ay tugon sa mosyon nina Atty. Aaron Pedrosa.			
33	Gloria dela Cruz, Chieftain in Brgy. Pagsangahan	Gaano katagal ang magiging benepisyo ng mga maapektuhan ng dam?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) Ang benepisyo ay pang matagalan hanggat maayos ang pamamalakad sa dam at maayos ang watershed malapit sa dam. Kaya mahalaga ang responsibilidad ng bawat isa para mapanatili ang kalinisan at kaayusan ng dam.	How long will the affected families receive benefits from the dam?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas) The benefits are continuous as long as the watershed is being taken care of by the community. The Dam Management will not easily shut down its operations, provided that there is correct management practices in place. The community has a significant role in making this happen.
34	Gloria dela Cruz	Ang ating tribo ay magiging bahagi ng plano sa pagpapaunlad ng komunidad sa Gen. Nakar? (hinarap kay Mayor E. Rozul)	(Mayor E. Rozul) Laging kasama ang mga katutubo sa lahat ng plano ng Gen. Nakar.	Will our tribe be part of the community development plan in Gen. Nakar? (addressed to Mayor E. Rozul)	(Mayor E. Rozul) The development plans in Gen. Nakar always account all Ips.

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
35	(Male participant), Sitio Cablao	Ilan pong pamilya ang talagang papaalisin sa Sitio Cablao? Kung sakaling lilipat sa ibang lugar, magkakaroon ba ng kalsada para maibyahe ang aming pananim?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas): May 55 na kabahayan ang aming tinitingnan sa ngayon. Ngunit May 11 na hindi pa makumpirma. Babalikan namin ulit ang inyong lugar para makumpirma ang mga numerong ito.	What is the exact number of families from Sitio Cablao that need to be relocated? In case they will be relocated, will the settlement area have access roads to transport our crops?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas): They have surveyed 55 houses, but 11 were not yet included due to absence on the day of the survey. The team will determine the actual number of families later. The numbers are still for confirmation.
36	Florentino Elsa R. Marco, Barangay Pamplona	Hindi po ba dudumi ang tubig sa dam dulot ng mga usok at ibang bagay sa kalawakan? Paano magiging ligtas ang tubig sa dam para sa pagluluto?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas): Bago pa man makarating ang tubig mula sa dam papunta sa bawat tahanan, may treatment o paglilinis na gagawin dito para manatili ang kalinisan at kaligtasan ng tubig.	How to maintain the water quality in the dam, given the exposure of the water to various pollutants present in the air.	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M. Ortigas): The water will have some more treatment before it shall be distributed to the houses. The management will ensure strict adherence in the Philippine Standards for Potable Water.
37	Renato Manalo, Sitio Cablao, Brgy. Pagsangahan	Kung sakaling maaapektuhan ang aming pananim, may matatanggap ba kami? Kung mayroon po, direkta ba iyong ibibigay sa amin?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M.Ortigas) Lahat ng pamilya at taong maaapektuhan ng pagtatayo ng dam ay makakatanggap ng benepisyo. Direkta itong ipapaabot sa inyo.	In case our crop will be affected by the dam construction, will we receive proper compensation? If so, will it be directly given to us?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M.Ortigas) Families and individuals who will be affected by the construction of the dam will be properly compensated. The said compensation will be directly given to the family or individual.

#	Person who raised the concern/s and Affiliation	TAGALOG		ENGLISH	
		Concern/s Raised	Response	Concern/s Raised	Response
38	Danilo Dela Cruz, Sitio Cablao	Napag-aralan na po ba ang hot spring sa lugar namin kung ito ay dulot ng isang bulkan? May mga tatamaan din po bang National Greening Program (NGP) sites? Sana ay tuloy pa rin ang aming kontrata sa NGP na maapektuhan ng dam.	(EDCOP-Engr. R.J. Ayson) Ayon sa pakikipag-ugnayan sa PHIVOLCS, hindi dulot ng isang bulkan ang hot spring. Hindi sufuric ang tubig nito. At tungkol sa NGP sites na maaapektuhan ng dam, may koordinasyon na sa mga ahensya ng gobyerno at tuloy lang din ang kontrata sa mga tagapangalaga nito.	Has the project team studied the nature of the existing hot spring if it is due to a volcano? With regards to the NGP sites that will be affected by the dam construction, will our contract be still effective?	(EDCOP-Engr. R.J. Ayson) He informed D. Dela Cruz that based on the studies, the water from the hot spring is not sulfuric in nature as per coordination with Usec. R.U Solidum of PHIVOLCS. As regards the National Greening Program, he said that proper coordination is being done with the proper authorities already. The existing contract will still be valid upon transfer of the NGP sites.
39	Mario Jimena, Barangay Pamplona	Ano ang maaaring epekto ng dam sa daloy ng tubig sa ibaba ng ilog?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M.Ortigas) May mekanismo ang dam para ma-kontrol ang daloy ng tubig kung kinakailangan.	What could be the possible effect of the dam in the rate of water flow in the downstream?	(EDCOP-Engr. N.M.Ortigas) The dam has mechanisms to control the rate of waterflow when deemed necessary.

5 FORUM OUTPUTS

- Based on the Open Forum, representatives of MWSS and EDCOP agreed to revisit some areas that will be affected by the dam construction to validate the following: risks brought by flooding, number of families that need to be relocated, optional resettlement areas, arrangements regarding the National Greening Program (NGP) sites, among others.

- The Social Development Programs shall be enhanced based on the inputs at the public hearing and in close consultation with the IP groups and respective leaders. The process shall also ensure ownership of the plan among the stakeholders and other interested parties. This is in response to the recurring expression of the need to be included in the development process involved in the Kaliwa Dam Project.
- The participants were enjoined to provide DENR-EMB with additional inputs based on the presented Kaliwa Dam Project through submission of a position paper to be sent thru e-mail: [eiamd.emb.co@gmail](mailto:eiamd.emb.co@gmail.com) or through telephone numbers 920-22-40 / 920-22-41.
- Everyone is welcome to participate in the next round of public hearing in (1) Teresa, Rizal, (2) Infanta, Quezon, and (3) Daraitan, Tanay, Rizal on August 27, August 28 and September 02, respectively.
- Complete documentation of the public hearing shall be uploaded in the EMB website: www.emb.gov.ph.

6 ADJOURNMENT

The Public Hearing officially adjourned at 1:30 p.m.

7 ANNEXES

ANNEX 1: ATTENDANCE SHEET OF STAKEHOLDERS AND GENERAL PUBLIC

ANNEX 2: DISSEMINATION OF INFORMATION

Annex 2.1: Affidavit of Publication

Annex 2.2: Publication in Newspaper of General Circulation

Annex 2.3: Notice of Public Hearing

Annex 2.4: Posting in Public Areas

Annex 2.5: Invitation Letters

ANNEX 3: PUBLIC HEARING PROCEEDINGS

Annex 3.1: Matrix of Issues Raised and the Proponent's/DENR Response

Annex 3.2: Summary of Issues beyond the mandate of the EMB

Annex 3.3: Transcription of Proceedings

ANNEX 4: VIDEO, PHOTO AND AUDIO DOCUMENTATION

Annex 4.1: Video Footages & Audio Recordings

Annex 4.2: Photographs

ANNEX 5: POWERPOINT PRESENTATION OF THE PROJECT AND EIA STUDY